

# **Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**

Plans Review Subcommittee

### Thursday, January 14, 2010

#### **LEGAL ACTION REPORT**

1. Call to Order / Roll Call: 1:01 p.m.

Commissioners: Teresita Majewski, Demion Clinco, Kathy Nabours, Patsy Waterfall,

Gal Witmer, Bill Mackey, Sharon Chadwick

Staff: Frank S. Podgorski, Jonathan Mabry, Kevin Mc Elheney, Brian Conte

2. Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone:

RND 09-05 Rialto Block-Façade Improvements; 300 East Congress Street (Rio Nuevo Downtown Zone)

Presentation by Bill Jones, Project Manager, on the façade improvements to the Rialto Block located on the south side of East Congress Street between North 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue and North Toole Avenue. Mr. Jones presented the tile medallions to be located on the columns and paint colors for the exterior walls and trim colors as reviewed in the field on January 11, 2010, by Commissioner Chadwick. He also presented the proposed wood door stains. Commissioners agreed upon a suitable stain for the doors after consideration of several stain samples (Lighter Red #3) presented by Mr. Jones.

Motion by Kathy Nabours to acknowledge the paint colors and tile medallions for the columns as recommended by Commissioner Chadwick in the field and recommendation for the wood door stain (Lighter Red #3).

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 6-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

# 3. Capital Improvement Projects:

City of Tucson-Parks & Recreation Department/Catalina Park-Facility Improvements (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Keven McElheney, City of Tucson, Parks & Recreation Department, and Walt Rogers, designer, on the improvements to the Catalina Park located in the West University

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission Plans Review Subcommittee January 14, 2010 Page 2

Historic Preservation Zone (WUHPZ) at North 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue between East First and East Second Streets.

Both the Catalina Park and the De Anza Park are contributing historic properties in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. The current proposal was reviewed by the West University Neighborhood Association in November 2009 with a recommendation to address the historic aspects of the park by maintaining the existing and enhancing the park with new features. The park will most likely not be open this summer due to City of Tucson budget constraints. A six (6') foot high wrought iron fence is among the improvements proposed on the submitted plan.

Based on the proposal and information provided, Commissioners agreed that a formal submittal through the HPZ application process is required so that the historical context is addressed and the salient historical features remaining in the park are incorporated into proposed improvements. Commissioners urged the presenters to consult the Secretary of the Interior Standards through Jonathan Mabry's office to design a revised plan that blends the old features with new proposed features (historic landscaping and historic structures) and submit an HPZ application to formally seek recommendations by both the WUHPZAB and the plans review subcommittee of the TPCHC. It was also recommended presenters submit their revised plan to the West University Neighborhood Association (WUNA) prior to the HPZ review/approval process meetings.

The presenters agreed to return at a later date once a revised plan is completed.

2353 North First Avenue-Demolition (HABS Level 1) El Cortez Heights Neighborhood (National Register Eligible)

Presentation by Brian Conte, City of Tucson, Department of Transportation, on the proposed demolition of a residential structure located on the southwest corner of East Grant Road/North Euclid Avenue. This structure will eventually be demolished as part of the Grant Road Widening Project which will be undertaken in phases over a period of several years. Mr. Conte submitted a letter from Tori Stypula, Chairperson, El Cortez Heights Neighborhood Association, urging the demolition of the residence at this time. The city has secured the property on numerous occasions since it has repeatedly been broken into and the Tucson Police Department has responded many times to reports of vagrants on the property. This property is not listed on the National Register but remains eligible for inclusion on the register. The proposed widening plan for Grant Road indicates this property will be demolished in the future.

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend demolition of the residence.

Seconded by Kathy Nabours.

Motion passed. Vote 4-2. Chair Majewski did not vote.

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission Plans Review Subcommittee January 14, 2010 Page 3

## 4. Regular Cases:

HPZ 09-47 Flores-Rehabilitation/Addition/Accessory Structure; 424 East 1<sup>st</sup> Street (West University Historic Preservation Zone) (Revised Plan)

Presentation by Leo Katz, architect, on the proposed addition to an existing contributing historic residence located in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. The revised plan is less intrusive on the contributing historic residence than the original plan and has the support in a letter from Bob Frankeberger, State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO), indicating the current contributing historic status of the residence will not be compromised.

The architectural details were discussed amongst the commissioners and the architect including windows, doors, roof material, location of mechanical (ground) and the issue of an attached garage in the rear yard. Although the West University Historic Preservation Zone Advisory Board recommended an attached carport as opposed to an attached garage, the Commissioners believe the garage is not a major issue since it is located at the rear of the property and has the support of the SHPO.

Motion by Bill Mackey to recommend approval of the revised plan as proposed.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Amendment by Gal Witmer to include wood double-hung windows and wood doors throughout the addition and return for a "minor review" in the field for paint colors, exterior perimeter walls and gates.

Amended motion seconded by Patsy Waterfall with Commissioner Mackey in agreement.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 6-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

HPZ 09-55 Wings on Words-Sign; 202 East Speedway Boulevard (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by David Torres, Double T Signs, on the installation of a sign on the preschool located at the southeast corner of East Speedway Boulevard/ North 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue in the West University Historic Preservation Zone. The sign meets requirements of Sec. 2.8.8.6 M. of the City of Tucson Land Use Code. Discussion on the location and material for the proposed sign.

Motion by Kathy Nabours to recommend approval of the sign as proposed.

Seconded by Patsy Waterfall.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 6-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission Plans Review Subcommittee January 14, 2010 Page 4

HPZ 09-58 Curtin-Accessory Structure (Detached Garage); 233 North Main Avenue (El Presidio Historic Preservation Zone)

Presentation by Mary Jo Curtin, property owner, on the proposed new construction of a detached garage located in the rear yard of a contributing historic residence in the El Presidio Historic Preservation Zone. The pedestrian door will be wood and there will be no windows. The colors will match the residence and a metal raised panel garage door will be installed. Ms. Curtin mentioned that because of the newly installed in-ground swimming pool, a security fence and gate are required and will be submitted as a "minor review" in the field for review/recommendation.

Motion by Gal Witmer to recommend approval for the detached garage as proposed and with the conditions discussed (i.e. wood pedestrian door/metal raised panel door).

Seconded by Bill Mackey.

Motion passed unanimously. Vote 6-0. Chair Majewski did not vote.

- 5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:
  - a. Minor Reviews: HPZ 09-56 Phillips-Window Replacement; 830 North Bean Avenue (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

HPZ 09-57 Taschuk-Windows/Door/Rear Siding; 318 East 13<sup>th</sup> Street (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

HPZ 09-59 De Lorenzo-Wall/Gate; 821 South Bean Avenue (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

HPZ 09-60 Gallaher-Fence/Gates; 821 South 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue (Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone)

HPZ 10-01 Malibu-Sign (Change of Copy); 825 East University Historic Preservation Zone #161 (West University Historic Preservation Zone)

- b. Appeals: No appeals at this time.
- c. Zoning Violations: Zoning violations in historic preservation zones are reported to Code Enforcement section of Community Services (792-CITY). A city inspector is assigned the case and if a zoning violation is confirmed, the property owner is taken through the HPZ application process in order to abate the violation.
- d. Historic Preservation Zone Development Standards: No report at this time.
- 6. Call to the Audience: No one to speak.
- 7. Meeting adjourned at 2:57 p.m.